

Appendix 3. Detailed summary of how we have reflected public engagement comments in the revised Culture, Heritage and Sport framework.

Author: Jim Hinks, Head of Culture, Heritage and Sport Policy.

The public engagement shows that the majority of respondents support the direction of travel in our draft culture framework, with a high percentage of ‘agree’ and ‘partially agree’ responses, and low percentages of ‘disagree’ responses.

Area	Level of agreement		
	Agree	Partially agree	Disagree
The themes	75%	19%	6%
People ambition	74%	22%	4%
People interventions	68%	30%	2%
Place ambition	73%	23%	4%
Place interventions	71%	24%	5%
Skills ambition	78%	19%	3%
Skills interventions	66%	30%	4%
Business ambition	81%	14%	4%
Business interventions	75%	21%	4%
Definitions	78%	13%	9%

While we see this as validation of the key themes, ambitions and interventions proposed in the framework, we have also paid close attention to the text responses provided by those who indicated they ‘partially agree’ or ‘disagree’.

Some feedback from these responses has been considered and implemented in the framework, where we felt it was a) in scope, b) actionable, c) did not conflict with an aspect of the framework that we feel has already been validated. The comments below are summarised for space and clarity, and representative of trends within the feedback (i.e. is a thematic point made by more than one respondent).

Do these four themes cover all the areas of culture, heritage, and sport that we should support? Agree 75%, Partially Agree 19%, Disagree 6%.

Key themes of comments	Actioned?
Include more sites including UNESCO World heritage sites in the intro and map	To implement at design phase
Sport shouldn't be included – should be separate.	N/A – noted but out of scope.
Culture needs better transport so people can get to it.	See Place: <i>We will consider how culture, heritage and sport can</i>

	<i>contribute to other areas of policy such as regeneration, housing, health and wellbeing, policing and crime, and transport.</i>
Health and wellbeing should be included.	Health and wellbeing now in intro, People Ambition , People 'why it is important' and People 'what we will measure' .
Culture can bring diverse people together	N/A
More about attracting students and retaining graduates.	See Skills

Q2. Is this the right ambition for the People theme? Agree 74%, Partially Agree 22%, Disagree 4%

Key themes of comments	Actioned?
Should mention all groups covered by the EQ act 2010	Actioned in 'Ambition': <i>Everyone in West Yorkshire can enjoy culture, heritage and sport, and no one will face barriers due to age, disability, gender reassignment, marriage or civil partnership, pregnancy or maternity, race, religion or belief, sex, sexual orientation, or socio-economic background.</i>
Supporting events is no use if people don't engage because they don't feel like culture is for them	Actioned in Introduction: <i>Culture, heritage and sport is threaded through the lives of people in West Yorkshire so that it is relevant, enjoyable and supports our sense of well-being. It is shaped, produced and participated in by all parts of our population.</i>
Include health and wellbeing	Actioned in Ambition: <i>Culture, heritage and sport is threaded through the lives of people in West Yorkshire so that it is relevant, enjoyable and supports our sense of well-being. It is shaped, produced and participated in by all parts of our population.</i> Invest: <i>We will invest in activities that increase people's health and wellbeing.</i>
Address climate and environment	Actioned in People, Invest: <i>We will invest in activities that tackle the climate emergency and protect our environment.</i>
Should be less about 'Pride'	N/A
Should be more about 'Pride'	N/A

Q3. Are these the right ways to achieve the People ambition? Agree 68%, Partially Agree 30%, Disagree 2%

Key themes of comments	Actioned?
Certain types of cultural activities require greater investment in order to survive – e.g. classical music, opera, ballet etc.	Not actioned. Not appropriate for certain types of cultural activity/art forms to be singled out in the framework, but considered on a case by case basis in delivery.
Reference collaboration with LAs	Have included this line in the intro: <i>this means working together with the five local authorities in West Yorkshire, and helping people and organisations to work together across the region</i>
More investment in sport activities, training and equipment.	Covered in Place Skills.
We need to recognise and address the class and income barriers that can prevent people entering and sustaining careers in creative industries and prevent our communities participating in cultural activities	Addressed in Ambition: or socio-economic background.

Q4. Is this the right ambition for the Place theme? Agree 73%, Partially Agree 23%, Disagree 4%

Key themes of comments	Actioned?
Need for local / community agency in planning decisions particularly in relation to built heritage.	Actioned in Place: <i>We will consider how culture, heritage and sport can contribute to other areas of policy such as regeneration, housing, health and wellbeing, policing and crime, and transport. However, it should be noted that the CA does not have local planning powers.</i>
Commitment to sustainability and environmentally friendly approaches	Actioned in People, Invest: <i>We will invest in activities that tackle the climate emergency and protect our environment.</i>
People have access to other environments and the diversity of places and cultures, bringing in greater rural access and enjoyment of rural places for everyone.	Actioned in Ambition: <i>People enjoy engaging with their historic and rural environment and in invest: We will invest in culture, heritage and sport activity that connects people to the historic and/or rural environment.</i>
The Internationally recognised heritage is a key missing component as are the Green Flag parks	Actioned in Collaboration: <i>We will support regeneration projects involving</i>

	<i>the creative industries and heritage sector.</i>
--	---

Q5. Are these the right ways to achieve the Place ambition? Agree 71%, Partially Agree 24%, Disagree 5%

Key themes of comments	Actioned?
Review "story of who we are" not one story, leads to marginalisation. Sounds a bit right wing and like there's a particular narrative that you're supporting.	Story amended to stories .
Better opportunities for communities to help shape policy and delivery of Culture etc and for communities to define the outcomes for their neighbourhoods. So this might be stronger forums and local networks; formal processes within policy and decision-making and new, collaborative forms of funding and decision-making relating to grants, etc	Delivery – if we launch a community funding strand?
We have football and cricket in the area, nothing other than bowls for seniors. In todays world it seems it is all about the young.	Delivery – if we launch a community funding strand?
Facilitating an understanding, appreciation and love for our green spaces and nature corridors in their own right.	Actioned in Ambition: <i>People enjoy engaging with their historic and rural environment</i> and in invest: <i>We will invest in culture, heritage and sport activity that connects people to the historic and/or rural environment.</i>
An explanation of 'meanwhile places'. This is a grammatical nonsense! Are you going to support the development of a range of affordable venues for the performing arts for example?	Reference to meanwhile spaces removed.
Knowing about heritage is pretty meaningless unless people can visit heritage sites (see previous comments on the need for community self-drive minibus transport).	Actioned in Collaborate: <i>We will consider how culture, heritage and sport can contribute to other areas of policy such as regeneration, housing, health and wellbeing, policing and crime, and transport.</i>
There doesn't appear to be any reference within this section or the framework more broadly, of working with the local authorities. They are major players in all of the four themes and working in collaboration with them	Actioned in introduction

seems vital to achieving successful outcomes.	
There is the opportunity to specifically refer to attracting major events to West Yorkshire. There is growing research on the social benefits and 'pride of place' generated from hosting major events and our ambition should be to continue to work with UK Sport and Government on hosting such events locally. Examples include the World Triathlon Series hosted in Leeds and a number of places hosting Rugby League World Cup matches in October and November 2022, building on the social and economic impact from the Grand Depart and Tour de Yorkshire.	Covered in People, Collaborate: <i>We will work with our region's voluntary and professional sports clubs to increase participation in sport and physical activity</i> and Place, Invest: <i>We will invest in culture, heritage and sport activity that leaves a lasting legacy for local communities.</i>
Social prescribing: What about engaging with individuals to provide budgets to get them to create art especially if it gives the creative/person a mental health boost	Actioned in People, Ambition: <i>Culture, heritage and sport is threaded through the lives of people in West Yorkshire so that it is relevant, enjoyable and supports our sense of well-being. It is shaped, produced and participated in by all parts of our population.</i> And in People, Invest: <i>We will invest in activities that increase people's health and wellbeing.</i>
Affordable spaces for cultural venues, projects, etc seem to be severely lacking in Leeds compared to other cities. Many small, DIY, underground venues have had to close over the last decade due to it being impossible to make ends meet without becoming too expensive for the local population, especially young and marginalised people, to attend.	This is primarily a local authority issue – CA doesn't have planning powers as such. But worth considering for delivery interventions in business – e.g. support for venues?

Q6. Is this the right ambition for the Skills theme? Agree 78%, Partially Agree 19%, Disagree 3%

Key themes of comments	Actioned?
Is there something missing about all young people gaining critical life skills through early opportunities in culture and sport even if they don't enter the creative industries? There's no mention of how creative skills are transferrable and desirable in all other sectors.	Actioned in Collaborate: <i>We will work with schools to promote possibilities and pathways for careers in the creative industries, heritage and sport sectors, and to recognise the value of transferable creative skills in the wider business sector.</i>

Support for amateur or semi-professional groups. No mention of increasing participation in cultural and sporting activities in schools.	See above
Routes into and careers in heritage are biased towards financially secure individuals, low pay, part time roles, reliance on volunteering and placements make it unattainable and unsustainable	Actioned in Skills, 'Why it is Important' now references heritage . Ambition states: <i>West Yorkshire people from all backgrounds have the skills, opportunities, connections and confidence to build a sustainable career in these sectors</i>

Q7. Are these the right ways to achieve the Skills ambition? Agree 66%, Partially Agree 30%, Disagree 4%

Key themes of comments	Actioned?
We will make the Combined Authority skills training accessible to the creative AND HERITAGE industries and sport sectors. And also We will work with other organisations, such as HISTORIC ENGLAND, Arts Council England, Sport England, universities, trade associations and unions, to address gaps in knowledge-sharing and professional development.	Actioned: heritage now mentioned throughout skills theme. Not actioned. The issue is, we would have to name <i>all</i> applicable organisations, which is incompatible with keeping the framework punchy and readable.
Suggest: We will attract inward investment to provide more opportunity for those in this sector and create competition and a destination	See Business.
Work with Schools or school-age young people will need to be more than promotion - active engagement with cultural organisations and HEIs to diversify who feel those careers are for them	Consider for delivery
If larger organisations are securing large pots of funding they need to build partners with small, local organisations who they then fund to deliver certain projects rather than advertising high paid jobs that freelancers leave small organisations for as they need to afford to live.	Consider for delivery
Please focus on girls being more active, especially 12-20 year olds. Please ensure that sport includes ANY physical activity.	Actioned in definition or Sport to include physical activity .

Opportunities for people to retrain at any stage of their career in order to enter the sector.	Covered in Collaborate: <i>We will work with Further Education and Higher Education Institutions on joined-up approaches to meeting the regional demand for skills in the creative industries, heritage and sport sectors, and share lifelong learning opportunities.</i>
Why Higher education before further education . Many young people and adults access further education before entering higher education.	Actioned in Collaborate: <i>We will work with Further Education and Higher Education Institutions on joined-up approaches to meeting the regional demand for skills in the creative industries, heritage and sport sectors, and share lifelong learning opportunities.</i>
There is a risk that anchor institutions and partners are always the same usuals, already involved in supporting whichever initiative is 'in fashion'. According to our experience real anchor institutions are community-led, well established, innovative grassroots organisations, which are often overlooked	Consider in delivery
Please remember to include sole traders and partnerships in your investment plans, as they can also employ staff and many operate in the creative industries.	Covered in Ambition: <i>Freelancers are networked, know where to find help and resources, and are confident about their futures in West Yorkshire.</i> And in Collaborate and What we will Measure.
There is a specific issue in that public funds for training are distributed by the Education and Skills Funding Agency; and their Minimum Contract Level (£500,000) ensures that small training providers are excluded. Since much "niche" training, such as outdoor leadership, is provided largely or only by small organisations, such types of training are disproportionately affected by the ESFA policy.	Consider in Delivery.
Can we broker and support collaboration across creative industries across the whole of West Yorkshire, with opportunities for networking and	Covered in Collaborate: We will build and support regional networks of freelancers and SMEs.

peer to peer support and learning and opportunities for collaborative work? Smaller venues find it harder to resource comms and marketing - and a collaborative approach could have a huge impact.	Consider in delivery.
Yet again no mention of individual grants to promote 'people' to be artists or to take up a sport.	Consider in delivery.

Q8. Is this the right ambition for the Business theme? Agree 81%, Partially Agree 14%, Disagree 4%

Key themes of comments	Actioned?
This describes sectoral development well. I wonder if it's missing a wider point about celebrating the entrepreneurialism of the creative industries and supporting them to be seen as a core part of the wider private sector ...also doesn't mention innovation or productivity which is curious given how innovative these businesses can be	Actioned in Invest: We will champion entrepreneurs , and develop a business support offer that helps creative industries, heritage and sports businesses to flourish.
Need to acknowledge that amateur sports clubs are businesses too, albeit run by volunteers, and they need recognition and help too.	Covered in Invest: We will ensure that a range of different models , including co-operatives, CICs and social enterprises, can benefit from our business support offer.
Innovation Hubs to support the creative industries linked to climate sustainability and digital technology can go hand in hand with the cultural framework.	Actioned in Collaborate: We will take a multi-authority approach to developing and sustaining creative clusters and innovation hubs within the region.
Creative Health specialisms are recognised and further developed through targeted investment.	Covered in People
Investment needs to be shared more equally across the region, there also needs to be the infrastructure to make it more accessible for people	Consider in delivery

Q9. Are these the right ways to achieve the Business ambition? Agree 75%, Partially Agree 21%, Disagree 4%

Key themes of comments	Actioned?
Hate the reference to creative clusters - elitist nonsense that prioritises where some people believe they deserve more support than others.	Not actioned. Conflicts with other feedback about including creative clusters and hubs.

<p>How are we brokering out to national professional and trade bodies? The bit about the business support offer for a range of different models is odd. Are you trying to promote different management/delivery models? Are you suggesting anyone adopting a different management model should be prioritised? I see the relevance of additional help for CIC or social enterprises, as offering greater benefits to our communities, but this section is confusing.</p>	
<p>Libraries should be at the fore of this - they are already doing excellent work regionally with Leeds taking the lead.</p>	<p>Libraries covered in Introduction and People.</p>
<p>I would extend the commitment to meanwhile spaces to include co-working and flexible working spaces that bring creative industries and other industries together - to drive creative exchange & cross-fertilisation and facilitate collaboration</p>	<p>Consider in delivery</p>
<p>People can not register as a CIC if they do not have support of a professional who understands the paperwork. We need FREE support in completing this.</p>	<p>Consider in delivery – offer to include aspirant CiCs?</p>
<p>Affordable spaces for cultural venues, projects, etc seem to be severely lacking in Leeds compared to other cities.</p>	<p>See Place</p>
<p>Ensure creative industries and sport are supported to export</p>	<p>Consider in delivery</p>
<p>We certainly have a diversity of experienced sports, arts, media, design, heritage people so give them a chance to contribute! Don't go just for the NPH-style businessman in grey suits</p>	<p>Covered in Collaborate: We will scope opportunities for the creative industries to share their perspectives and expertise with the wider West Yorkshire business community</p>
<p>When considering investment in business support, please remember ALL small businesses, including sole traders and partnerships that operate in the creative industries. Many business support programs focus on coaching and mentoring, which is fine if you have the money and expertise in-house to implement their suggestions and advice. Offering accountancy support and help to transition to a Director for a year would make it less risky for many small</p>	<p>Covered in Invest: We will ensure that a range of different models, including co-operatives, CICs and social enterprises, can benefit from our business support offer.</p> <p>Consider in delivery</p>

businesses to seriously consider registering their business in the creative industries.	
There should be an explicit commitment to supporting the transfer of ownership of sporting clubs to fan co-operatives, particularly for semi-professional clubs playing at lower tiers e.g. football and rugby league.	Covered in Invest: We will ensure that a range of different models , including co-operatives, CICs and social enterprises, can benefit from our business support offer.
Actual Living Wage and salary ratios not exceeding 10:1 between highest and lowest paid within any creative industry in west Yorkshire will be mandatory before any grant aid or support can be received. Link . union membership will be encouraged within Creative Industries to protect workers rights and avoid traps such as unpaid internships.	Consider in Delivery
Within 'Invest', and the action linked to the business support offer, it is really important that this support included the many voluntary sports clubs and other cultural organisations that have capital assets such as studios, pitches, gyms and associated facilities. These struggle and have found the last few years very hard; they now face huge increases in energy costs.	Covered in Invest: We will ensure that a range of different models , including co-operatives, CICs and social enterprises, can benefit from our business support offer. Consider in delivery – Cost of Doing Business grants?

Q10. Do you agree with the definitions? Free text answer.

Key themes of comments	Actioned?
Perhaps landscape and environment, conservation professionals, artisan makers need to be noted in the creative industries definitions. Should the food industry be referenced?	To consider in definitions.
I believe culture should include popular culture	Popular culture is implicit within culture definition: When we say culture, we mean the process or product of any form of creative endeavour, including visual arts, music , theatre, film and TV , literature and spoken word, video and board games, fashion, design, architecture and crafts.
You completely miss out a real understanding of heritage in your definitions	Doesn't explain how. However the definition of heritage has been amended to include: <i>high streets, conservation areas and parks</i>

<p>The definition of culture seems to take into account only the material aspects of production. Culture is what define us as human beings, the system of believes, social interactions, customs, expressions that we share in a space and time. This informs the production of material artefacts, in the shape of visual arts, music, dance, theatre, film and TV, literature and spoken word, video and board games, fashion, design, architecture and crafts, but the definition seems to mistake the byproduct with the source.</p>	<p>Not actioned in definitions. It's a reasonable point (and covered in the introduction, to some extent) but we have to balance this with providing a definition that people can easily understand, in the context of this framework.</p>
<p>community should not be people in the arts etc. it should be those people who had never been encouraged to take up a pen or paint brush etc.</p>	<p>This doesn't reflect the definition of Community given.</p>

Q11. Are there any parts of the framework, or the language used within it, that don't make sense to you, or need more explanation? Free text answer.

Key themes of comments	Actioned?
<p>Some of the language could do with being more accessible and speaking more to diverse audiences. Some of the language used to describe the means by which to achieve the goals set , comes a cross as " middle class " complex sentence structures that might put some people off.</p> <p>Too much business speak.</p> <p>Too many buzz words, e.g. 'meanwhile spaces'.</p>	<p>We've tried to balance this requirement against the wishes of other stakeholders and respondents who have requested specific terminology.</p> <p>Reference to meanwhile spaces removed.</p> <p>In digital version of framework, any specific terms could be hyperlinked to the definition in the glossary.</p>
<p>The word 'support' is used. Is this funding support? If so, be explicit.</p>	<p>Amended to invest where applicable.</p>
<p>Looking at the references to 'business' which could useful explicitly state 'including voluntary and community groups'.</p>	<p>See People and Place themes.</p>
<p>Low attention to heritage - it uses the word but doesn't convey what it means</p>	<p>Definition amended.</p>
<p>know it's a framework focussing on the overall vision but when will you tell us WHAT you are going to do - this is still quite top level and vague</p>	<p>Action plan / delivery detail, on publication of final framework.</p>

2.3.18 Key stakeholder feedback since last Culture, Heritage and Sport Committee

<p>Historic England</p> <p>Place: We suggest reinforcing emphasis on West Yorkshire’s unique nature and distinctiveness as a place.</p> <p>Place ambition: we suggest adding that people are proud of their places, not just their communities (we know from work such as the HSHAZ programme that celebrating heritage at the heart of communities can bring people together in support of transforming their local places).</p> <p>Specifically, we propose that the actions could include collaboration on place-shaping, including with public bodies such as Historic England, and including a mention of specific places to collaborate on or within, such as historic high streets.</p> <p>Collaboration should also include parks and green spaces not just in terms of safety but rather the increased use and enjoyment of these valuable spaces, which contribute greatly to shaping places, and which in many places are also part of the wider historic environment. We would be happy to pick up a discussion around collaborating along these lines.</p> <p>In Theme 4, Business: <i>West Yorkshire is the place to grow your creative business</i> amended to explicitly include heritage.</p>	<p>To cover in intro / foreword</p> <p>Addressed in Ambition: People enjoy engaging with their historic and rural environment.</p> <p>Addressed in Invest: We will invest in culture, heritage and sport activity that connects people to the historic and/or rural environment.</p> <p>Actioned in Introduction, People, Place, Skills, and heritage definition amended to include high streets, conservation areas and parks</p> <p>High streets included in definition of heritage. Framework is too high level to set out specific places for interventions, and if we mention one public body, we would have to list all possible applicable ones. This conflicts with the need to keep it succinct.</p> <p>Actioned.</p> <p>Not actioned: I think this is implicit, and we have competing demands to keep it punchy.</p>
<p>Ministry of Others</p>	

<p>West Yorks as hub for Creative Health</p> <p>The ambition section - a couple of sentences/a short paragraph in a narrative might read better than bullet points?</p> <p>What we will measure - 'How we will demonstrate impact'</p> <p>I do also wonder whether skills and business need to be separate themes</p> <p>I have just realised that there is little or no reference to children and young people in the document.</p>	<p>West Yorks as hub for Creative Health now included in Introduction. Health and wellbeing now included in <i>People: Invest</i> and <i>People: What we will measure</i>.</p> <p>To consider, though bullets help readability.</p> <p>Can see the merits of this, but measure can include qualitative too.</p> <p>Helps with WYCA and LA workstreams.</p> <p>Correct – though there is reference to different skills interventions which imply age - in schools, lifelong learning.</p>
<p>TUC</p> <p><i>People, How we will do this, Broker to read: “We believe that increased public investment in the region’s culture, heritage and sport sectors is vitally important, will advocate for these sectors in the region, and will lobby and seek opportunities to draw down funds from central government”.</i></p> <p><i>“You can build a great, well-paid career in culture, heritage or sport in West Yorkshire”.</i></p> <p>Under 3. <i>Skills, Our Ambition</i> we urge the second bullet point to be amended to read <i>“More people have fair, well-paid work - low pay, poor working conditions and discrimination should have no place in the sector”.</i></p> <p>TUC YH CLIC welcomes the draft Cultural Framework’s strong emphasis on Equalities. In drafting more recent versions of the TUC YH Cultural Manifesto, TUC YH CLIC has moved away from referring to diversity and more to talking about equality and we</p>	<p>Have included public investment in Broker</p> <p>Well-paid work now referenced</p> <p>Well-paid work now referenced</p> <p>‘Why it is important’ now references equity.</p>

<p>suggest the Cultural Framework would benefit from talking more about equality, equity and inclusion and less about diversity.</p> <p>Replace 'employment' with "work"</p> <p>TUC YH CLIC believes there needs to be further policy development over meanwhile spaces. Often, a meanwhile space might be a single empty unit in a shopping area and when this is needed back, moving to another empty unit may be an option.</p>	<p>Actioned</p> <p>Reference to meanwhile spaces removed</p>
<p>Yorkshire Sport Foundation Reference voluntary as well as professional sports clubs</p> <p>Several instances where sport needs to be referenced in addition to culture and heritage.</p> <p>Sport definition to include physical activity.</p>	<p>Actioned</p> <p>Actioned</p> <p>Actioned</p>
<p>Bradford Cultural Voice Forum Makes sense to refer to culture as culture/s in some cases</p> <p>What is the WY cultural identity? What defines us? E.g. people from Keighley don't want to be defined as from Bradford. How do we build pride and ambition?</p> <p>Meanwhile spaces cause instability and uncertainty for the sector.</p> <p>In People, specific demographics should be mentioned</p>	<p>Actioned in places (and stories pluralised)</p> <p>To consider in delivery (e.g. if working with a DMO).</p>